Legislative Assembly of Ontario



Assemblée législative de l'Ontario

Official Report of Debates (Hansard)

, No. 195B Journal des débats (Hansard)

N° 195B

1<sup>st</sup> Session 43<sup>rd</sup> Parliament

Wednesday 11 December 2024 1<sup>re</sup> session 43<sup>e</sup> législature Mercredi

11 décembre 2024

Speaker: Honourable Ted Arnott Clerk: Trevor Day Président : L'honorable Ted Arnott Greffier : Trevor Day

#### Hansard on the Internet

Hansard and other documents of the Legislative Assembly can be on your personal computer within hours after each sitting. The address is:

## Le Journal des débats sur Internet

L'adresse pour faire paraître sur votre ordinateur personnel le Journal et d'autres documents de l'Assemblée législative en quelques heures seulement après la séance est :

https://www.ola.org/

#### **Index inquiries**

Reference to a cumulative index of previous issues may be obtained by calling the Hansard Reporting Service indexing staff at 416-325-7400.

## **Renseignements sur l'index**

Adressez vos questions portant sur des numéros précédents du Journal des débats au personnel de l'index, qui vous fourniront des références aux pages dans l'index cumulatif, en composant le 416-325-7400.

House Publications and Language Services Room 500, West Wing, Legislative Building 111 Wellesley Street West, Queen's Park Toronto ON M7A 1A2 Telephone 416-325-7400 Published by the Legislative Assembly of Ontario



Service linguistique et des publications parlementaires Salle 500, aile ouest, Édifice du Parlement 111, rue Wellesley ouest, Queen's Park Toronto ON M7A 1A2 Téléphone, 416-325-7400 Publié par l'Assemblée législative de l'Ontario

ISSN 1180-2987

# **CONTENTS / TABLE DES MATIÈRES**

Wednesday 11 December 2024 / Mercredi 11 décembre 2024

# PRIVATE MEMBERS' PUBLIC BUSINESS / AFFAIRES D'INTÉRÊT PUBLIC ÉMANANT DES DÉPUTÉES ET DÉPUTÉS

Rent Control for All Tenants Act, 2024, Bill 48, MPP Andrew; Ms. Bell; Mr. Glover; Ms. Karpoche / Loi de 2024 sur le contrôle des loyers pour tous les locataires, projet de loi 48, MPP Andrew;				
Mme Bell; M. Glover; Mme Karpoche				
Ms. Bhutila Karpoche				
Ms. Aislinn Clancy				
Mr. Joel Harden				
MPP Jill Andrew				
Mr. Chris Glover				
MPP Kristyn Wong-Tam				
Mr. Matthew Rae	11143			
Ms. Bhutila Karpoche	11144			
Second reading vote deferred	11145			

#### LEGISLATIVE ASSEMBLY OF ONTARIO

Wednesday 11 December 2024

Report continued from volume A.

1743

#### PRIVATE MEMBERS' PUBLIC BUSINESS

### RENT CONTROL FOR ALL TENANTS ACT, 2024 LOI DE 2024 SUR LE CONTRÔLE DES LOYERS POUR TOUS LES LOCATAIRES

Ms. Karpoche moved second reading of the following bill:

Bill 48, An Act to amend the Residential Tenancies Act, 2006 with respect to rules relating to rent / Projet de loi 48, Loi modifiant la Loi de 2006 sur la location à usage d'habitation en ce qui concerne les règles relatives au loyer.

The Deputy Speaker (Ms. Donna Skelly): Pursuant to standing order 100, the member has 12 minutes for her presentation.

**Ms. Bhutila Karpoche:** Imagine working full-time and still having to choose between paying rent and buying food. That's the reality for hundreds of thousands of Ontarians today.

We're in the midst of an affordability crisis, and housing is a major part of it. Rent is too damn high. Over the past decade, average rents have skyrocketed by a whopping 60%. In order to afford asking rents for a two-bedroom rental unit in Ontario, renters need, at minimum, an aftertax income of \$104,000 a year. Is it any wonder that more and more tenants—40% provide-wide—are spending the majority of their monthly income on rent?

People are having to sacrifice the basics just to keep a roof over their head: people like Stephen Fasugba, a 67year-old Toronto taxi driver who says that he's cut back to one meal a day to afford his \$2,450-a-month rent, and he's still coming up short; people like Karen Charmbury, a single mom who spends 100% of her monthly income on rent and relies on her mom and friends to help with food and clothing, despite working full time. She's part of a growing trend of Ontarians spending their entire paycheques on rent alone.

So many cannot afford to feed themselves and their families, and we're seeing this reflected in the record numbers of people standing in line at food banks because they've spent all their money on rent and have no other way to put food on the table.

# ASSEMBLÉE LÉGISLATIVE DE L'ONTARIO

Mercredi 11 décembre 2024

According to Feed Ontario's 2024 Hunger Report, over a million people in Ontario accessed a food bank between April 2023 and March 2024. That's a 25% increase over the previous year, and an 86% surge since the pandemic. And Speaker, a staggering 76% of Ontario's food bank clients are tenants.

The report also highlights that one in four food bank visitors cite employment as their primary source of income. Let me repeat that: One in four food bank visitors have a job. That represents a 17% increase from the Previous year and a 91% rise compared to pre-pandemic levels.

This housing crisis is a crisis of economic instability fuelled by skyrocketing rents. So why is rent skyrocketing? Well, one major reason is that, in 2018, the Ford Conservatives reinstated a loophole in Ontario's rent control rules. This loophole exempts all rental units built after 2018 from any rent control guidelines. Across the province, many buildings have no cap on how much rents can be increased by, and tenants are seeing massive increases year after year. What's more, any new rental unit that is constructed now or in the future will never be protected under rent control.

Ontario desperately needs more rental supply, but if we don't close this loophole, people are not going to be able to afford it. This loophole has led to unfair and unpredictable rent increases that are devastating to people who are just trying to get by, and it's only going to get worse.

Speaker, today, the Liberals announced that they will bring in rent control for units built after 2018, but that the rent control will be phased in. They cite a model where rent control is put in place after 20 years have passed. I do not understand this policy. So you're basically telling tenants in buildings that are built in 2018, "Oh, don't worry! You will be covered under rent control, but in 2038." That's effectively maintaining status quo. That tracks the Liberal way.

When the Liberals were in power for 15 years, with strong majorities for much of that time, they refused and failed to close this loophole until the dying days of their government. For years, tenants across Ontario pushed for action when they were facing skyrocketing rents and housing instability, but their struggles were ignored. It wasn't until mounting public pressure and the looming reality of a massive election defeat that the Wynne Liberal government finally acted to close the loophole, but it was too late. The Conservatives came to power and, under Premier Ford, right away, they reversed this policy, reinstating the exemption for new rental units and once LEGISLATIVE ASSEMBLY OF ONTARIO

again leaving tenants in recently constructed buildings without rent control protections.

The Liberal failure to prioritize tenants when they had ample opportunity to do so highlights why we can't rely on the Liberals on housing. To them, it's always dependent on political calculations, and not because it's the fair thing to do.

Speaker, so long as this loophole exists, Ontario's tenants are going to be vulnerable to predatory rent increases that make it very difficult to find and to maintain housing. We know it because we've seen it. For years now, tenants in the Livmore High Park buildings in my riding have faced double-digit rent increases: 17%, 18%, 20%. More than 550 Livmore residents signed and delivered a letter to their corporate landlord, GWL Realty, asking them to stop these unpredictable rent increases. The landlord's response? That the building was not subject to rent control, and so the tenants had no case. Mind you, these are new buildings, so no major repairs or capital projects are needed. The rent hikes are solely for the profit of landlords and their shareholders.

#### 1750

We all remember the story of two sisters in Toronto–St. Paul's whose rent was increased to \$9,500. Their building also did not have rent control, and so they had no recourse and were forced to move. These outcomes are predictable. We have seen time and time again that, when given the opportunity, the big corporate landlords will always put profit first.

The 2018 loophole has opened the door to new methods of rent gouging, with corporations like GWL Realty using AI pricing software YieldStar to drive up rent. Together with my constituents and the Livmore High Park Tenants' Association, I wrote to the Competition Bureau back in September to investigate the software used for potential rent fixing. GWL Realty says they've now terminated the use of this software. There are many others who still use it and must stop.

I asked the Competition Bureau to see if there was any evidence of collusion, and then, if there was, all appropriate remedies must be pursued, including enforcement and criminal charges, to protect tenants from predation. Without the 2018 loophole, these corporate landlords could never have used the software to inflate rent. Investigating these practices, banning the use of this software isn't enough; we need to address the root of the problem.

Liberals and Conservatives claim this loophole encourages purpose-built developments, but we know that stable, regulated markets are just as effective at driving growth while protecting tenants. Recent reports from the Canadian Centre for Policy Alternatives, the Canada Mortgage and Housing Corp. and even KPMG have all found that jurisdictions with rent control in place continue to see significant development of new rental units. This shows that fairness and affordability can coexist with growth and investment.

Speaker, it is also the case that unstable housing doesn't just harm tenants, it weakens local economies, because when people spend all their income on rent, they have less to spend on everything else. They can't save up for retirement or contribute to their local businesses. The ripple effects are felt by everyone.

Unstable housing also places greater strain on public resources. There's overwhelming evidence that shows housing instability is a major determinant of health. When people are forced to choose between rent and essentials like food or medication, the long-term costs to our health care system are massive. I'm sure everyone can agree that these costs far outweigh any short-term profits for the big landlords.

This bill is about restoring fairness and stability to Ontario's rental market. Housing is the foundation for health, stability and opportunity, but unregulated rent increases leave tenants in a constant state of uncertainty, unable to plan their futures. How can anyone build a life when they don't know what their largest monthly expense will be? How can anyone plan for their future when they don't know if they will be able to maintain their home and afford next month's rent? We don't expect businesses to operate this way, so why expect individuals and families to?

This instability is also contributing to the homelessness crisis that is affecting every corner of our province and many, many Conservative ridings. And that, in these cold winter months, is a matter of life and death.

This government must act. Today, I'm bringing forward a very simple and straightforward solution. Let's pass the Rent Control for All Tenants Act, reinstate rent control on all units and give all Ontario tenants the housing stability and security they deserve.

The Deputy Speaker (Ms. Donna Skelly): Further debate?

**Ms. Aislinn Clancy:** I really appreciate this bill, because until we get a handle on the hemorrhaging of affordable rentals in this province, we will never get a handle on the homelessness crisis that faces our community.

I remember when I became a city councillor and a friend of mine who lived in a townhome complex on Blucher Street was being bullied out of her apartment. I then went to the Social Development Centre and learned from experts from the University of Waterloo about the factors that affect the decline in affordable housing in this province, increases in demovictions and renovictions and the lack of rent control on new buildings.

I'll quote Mickey Neuberger, the CMO of realtor.com. He says "inequality and a history of discriminatory housing policies have made it harder for BIPOC and LGBTQ individuals to overcome housing hurdles, and since housing is a predominant way to build wealth, that's led to a significant wealth gap across generations." I think young people across this province are feeling that wealth gap. It's a lot of young people and newcomers that end up in these newer builds, who end up being subject to these alarming increases in rent. I've talked to young people in the park, and it's hard for them to budget. Imagine you set up your budget, you're used to spending a certain amount of money on your rent and all of a sudden, your landlord jacks up the rent by 10%, 20%, 30%. There are bad actors: We had a family from Syria in my riding, and they wanted them out. Their rent went from \$1,000 to \$4,000 as a way to remove them from their home. People have fled wars, and they come to Canada looking for safety, looking for a roof and food, looking for a bright future for their kids, and they're met with some of these harmful policies that are being utilized by bad actors to remove them from their homes. These big corporate profits that are put ahead of the needs of the people of Ontario need to be stopped. It's important that we put people's needs before these massive profits.

Of course, people run businesses, they want to pay their employees, they want to make sure that they pay the bills in their businesses, but the profits that these housing corporations are earning are obscene. I'm part of the OMERS pension plan; housing was the number one earner. We need to be critical thinkers about where that money is coming from, because it is coming off the backs of our low- and middle-income people, and this is why we see these alarming rates of homelessness in our communities.

In my community in Waterloo region, homelessness has doubled in two years—doubled. We now have over 2,300 people at our last point and count of people who do not have stable housing. If we expect people to be healthy—we talk about mental health all the time in this place—if we want them to be stable, then invest money in our health care system. We know that we need to ensure that there's housing for the people who live here. And this housing can't be precarious. We can't wonder month by month by month if we are going to be able to pay the bills.

We have a lot of privilege in this place. I'm grateful that I have a two-income family and I can pay the bills, even though—anyway, I can pay the bills. But for so many families—I think it's 50% of people in Ontario that live paycheque to paycheque. Imagine if you're living paycheque to paycheque in one of these new builds and your rent goes up by more than 10%. It's like the Wild West.

It doesn't lead to housing supply. We have lower housing starts in this province-I appreciate that we have an increase in purpose-built rentals, but we need an increase in affordable rentals too, and we have to protect the affordable units we have. Some 95% of affordable units were built before 1993-or 1993 to 1995. Our affordable stock is aging, and too often, if you google on YouTube when you go home tonight, you will find people who will coach you on tenant transitions-transitioning tenants out of their home. There are experts on YouTube that have their channels and tell you they can make you 15% to 19%. That is alarming. These are peoples' lives. If you want to do a hustle, you work harder, you hustle harder, but we should not have legislation that allows bad actors to uproot people from their homes. These are families, young people, newcomers and folks with disabilities being dislocated and poured into our shelter system.

There's a shelter in my riding, Schwaben Club, it has 100 people in it and there is a lineup of walkers at the door.

We should be ashamed that this is allowed to happen in this province, and so I urge all of us to get behind proper protections to ensure we can get rid of exclusionary—

# **The Deputy Speaker (Ms. Donna Skelly):** Thank you. Further debate?

**Mr. Joel Harden:** I want to thank my friend from Parkdale–High Park for putting real rent control on the table before this House today. She said it very well in her opening remarks: "Rent is too damn high." Right now it's over \$2,000 on average in the city of Ottawa.

We are living in a context in this country where 1.5 million Canadians are in core housing need. What that means, according to the experts like Carolyn Whitzman from the University of Ottawa: one to two paycheques away from eviction. What that translates into in my city, Speaker, is 45,000 people—just over 45,000 people. When you look at the amount of evictions, N13s, demovictions that are happening in our city, those went up, in 2021-22, according to researchers at Carleton—get ready for it—545%.

1800

We are seeing the affordable rental homes in our city that have been existing and protected under rent control being lost. When the rental stock is being left to rot and then an above-guideline increase comes in, a property owner comes in and, I believe, unethically takes advantage of marginalized and vulnerable people, it's wrong—it's wrong.

What we need are clear rules. What do we have from the province of Ontario? I would submit to you, Speaker, we have rent control rules that are like Swiss cheese. You can drive a Mack truck through some of the gaps in our rent control legislation. That's how you get a 545% increase in eviction applications. This is wrong, but people have fought back.

In the time I'm speaking to the members' bill, I want to talk about ACORN in our city, who have been organizing tenant organizations who have been fighting back. I want to talk about the people at Manor Village who have homes between \$1,100 and \$1,300 for two- or three-bedroom townhomes. They had to fight to keep those. They did not get the support from their member of provincial Parliament, unfortunately, but they did get the support of people across our city who got behind them, who fought for them and they were able to maintain their homes.

That matters, but what we need for every other tenant in this province is security. They need to know that the law of Ontario is behind them, that there are no fining rules, there are no ways around the law that would allow them to be removed from their home.

Everybody in this country deserves a safe, secure place to call home and deserves fair rules by which we can all play. I salute the member for Parkdale–High Park. The rent is too damn high. Let's do something about it.

The Deputy Speaker (Ms. Donna Skelly): Further debate?

**MPP Jill Andrew:** I'm honoured to stand as a cosponsor of Bill 48, the Rent Control for All Tenants Act. I'm speaking on behalf of my St. Paul's community, demanding rent control again. I thank Oakwood Vaughan Community Organization, among others at home, for supporting our demands.

We're in an affordability, a homelessness and a housing crisis, and this Conservative Premier has refused to admit or take responsibility for any of it. We have nearly a quarter of a million people homeless in Ontario. The number of households experiencing a form of homelessness has increased 109% on this government's watch.

This Premier has rolled out the red carpet for unprecedented tenant gouging and has no shortage of developers and corporate landlord buddies eager to take advantage of Conservative loopholes designed to incentivize profit over people. The majority of my community are renters, not developers, so they know very well that this Conservative government is not working for them.

In St. Paul's, we know housing is a human right. We know it's a social determinant of health. We will not stop until we secure rent control, terminate vacancy decontrol and illegal evictions and ban above-guideline rent increases used by many bad-faith corporate landlords to gouge seniors on fixed incomes, single parents, people on ODSP or OW etc. We will create real supports for our commercial tenants and secure a properly resourced, fair and just LTB, not the over-53,000-backlog circus that has grown and grown under this government's watch.

On November 15, 2018, the Conservative government removed rent control from new buildings and rental units that had not been occupied before that date. I've tried to imagine their rationale, and all I can come up with is this government's serious dislike of tenants. Maybe it's Conservative neo-liberalism, punishment for those who can't pull themselves up by their own bootstraps or who don't have intergenerational wealth like this Premier does. Either way, just like that, rent control was gone.

In St. Paul's, we had to say goodbye to two community members who fell prey to this government's attack on renters, Yumna and Khadeja. They rented a two-bedroom, two-bathroom condo, and it spiked from \$2,500 to \$9,500 a month, a \$7,000 increase. Despite all our community efforts—including a petition with over 25,000 signatures begging this government to step in and help save their home—they lost their home and they had to leave our community. By ripping away rent control, this Premier essentially kicked those two young sisters and countless others out of their house. Does that make this Conservative government the worst landlord in Ontario? Well, if the shoe fits.

# The Deputy Speaker (Ms. Donna Skelly): Further debate?

**Mr. Chris Glover:** It's an honour to stand in this House and speak in favour of the Rent Control for All Tenants Act. When this government got into power, rents were rising, house prices were rising, and what did they do? They threw fuel on the fire by eliminating rent control on any building built after 2018. The result has been astronomical increases in the amounts of rent.

In my riding of Spadina-Fort York:

—Corey Campbell: Her rent was increased by \$300 a month;

—Pantes Parvin: a 21% increase, from \$2,200 to \$2,700 a month;

—Megan Lyons-Miller: a 38% increase, from \$2,100 to \$2,900 a month;

—Marcy Hewson is negotiating with her landlord and if she can't keep him down on the rent increase, she's going to be leaving the province;

—Sam Hamilton: This, government, is a colleague and a friend of mine. Her rent, in a purpose-built rental went from \$3,200 to \$3,500.

This government is boasting about their purpose-built rentals, that they're spending billions of taxpayer dollars, subsidizing purpose-built rentals in this province. That's one of them. So, \$3,200 is what it came in at and then after a year of living there, her rent went up to \$3,500 a month. That's not affordable housing. This government is passing our tax dollars on to for-profit developers that are gouging the tenants.

They voted against my motion to build 250,000 units of affordable housing, including 15,000 units of supportive housing, to help bring an end to homelessness. What is the legacy of this government? We've got a million people using food banks in the province; 20% of those people using food banks spend 100% of their income on rent. It's getting out of control. These corporate landlords, they're using YieldStar, which is an AI software, to inflate rents because it tells them how much YieldStar thinks they can increase the rent. It's a kind of collusion to inflate rents.

Is this government stepping in and stopping it? Absolutely not because they—well, I'm not allowed to say why in this House, but obviously they're colluding with the developers in this. They are not supporting the tenants of this province. Your legacy, the legacy of this Conservative government, is 234,000 people homeless, 1,400 encampments. You have an opportunity today to admit that you made a mistake and backtrack and reintroduce rent control on all units in the province of Ontario.

The Deputy Speaker (Ms. Donna Skelly): Further debate?

**MPP Kristyn Wong-Tam:** It is with tremendous pride I rise in this House to speak in support of this bill, Bill 48, Rent Control for All Tenants Act. The bill's name says it all. In Toronto Centre, where 70% of the residents actually rent their home, this bill would actually transform their lives. It will make things easier and more manageable.

The rent control bill that's before us is critical, it's lifesaving, it's community-preserving. I want to thank my colleague and friend the MPP from Parkdale–High Park for bringing it forward.

Rent control brings stability and affordability to housing. When the Conservative government tore up the recently minted rent control changes that were brought in in 2018 during the dying days of the Liberal government, it actually created greater uncertainty and confusion. My office was flooded with countless calls from tenants confused about whether or not their building was all of a sudden covered by rent control or not. But it was largely because they didn't know who moved in at what time and when, something that isn't always advertised and not known.

There is zero data—zero—to suggest that removing rent control increases the construction of purpose-built rentals. We know this because for 29 years under the Liberals and Conservatives—and Liberals and Conservatives without rent control—we haven't seen a massive construction of purpose-built rentals. It has not shown us that result at all, despite all claims from the government.

#### 1810

What it has done is it has allowed for de facto evictions, and if a landlord decides to raise the rent on an existing tenant to a price that is no longer affordable, that tenant is then forced out, and I'm concerned that this government is treating this new attribute as an existing benefit of decontrol.

This government should be ashamed of themselves for scrapping rent control. The scrapping of rent controls after 2018 also encouraged owners and property managers of older purpose-built rental buildings to now knock them down. They're no longer rebuilding them. These buildings are not falling apart because they need massive renovations—no, no, that's not the case. They are chugging along, full of neighbours, full of community members, but they're being destroyed at great cost, at great environmental hazards and displacement of residents because they cannot find comparable homes now because they're being knocked down.

I want to thank No Demovictions Toronto for all the exceptional work that they have been doing. They have been leading the fight in our city, trying to give tenants hope against big predatory landlords. They can't do it alone. We have to help them.

If we want to reverse the encampments, if we want to end homelessness, if we want to give tenants a fight, a chance to make it in this city and across Ontario, then we have to pass this bill and we have to do it today.

The Deputy Speaker (Ms. Donna Skelly): Further debate?

**Mr. Matthew Rae:** I rise this evening to address this Legislature on the matter of Bill 48, the Rent Control for All Tenants Act, 2024, introduced by the member opposite.

While this bill may be well-intentioned, it poses significant risks to Ontario's rental housing market and the very tenants it seeks to protect. Our government remains steadfast in its commitment to balance the needs of tenants and landlords, ensuring both affordability and availability in our housing market. While I understand the intention behind this bill—to make housing more affordable—what this bill will actually do is deter the construction of muchneeded rental housing, exacerbating the very crisis it seeks to address.

We all know that Ontario faces a severe shortage of rental housing and the root cause of rising rents is supply, Speaker—scarcity of that supply. To solve this, we must prioritize increasing the supply of rental housing, not discouraging its construction. Our government's policies have demonstrated their ability to deliver results.

Since implementing measures to incentivize construction of purpose-built rental housing, Ontario has experienced record-breaking years of rental housing development. Last year alone, nearly 19,000 purpose-built rental starts were recorded—the highest in our province's history. The success is no accident but by direct outcome of our balanced policies that incentivize the construction of more rental housing while maintaining rent control protections for 90% of renters in this province, Speaker.

These policies strike the critical balance and the right balance. They provide protections for the majority of tenants, including capping rent increases at 2.5% for 2023, 2024 and 2025, which are the lowest allowable rent increases in Canada—lower than even the NDP governments in Manitoba and BC. We have the strongest rent controls in the entire country.

As I mentioned, over 90% of tenants have rent control where they are currently living, and while at the same time we are fostering an environment where developers are motivated to invest in new rental projects, these investments are critical to addressing the severe supply storage that is the root cause of Ontario's affordability challenges. Moreover, we have ensured that tenants' rights remain a cornerstone of our housing strategy, providing stability and predictability for renters across the province. This is how we ensure that growth and fairness coexist within the housing sector.

Let's not forget that the NDP themselves introduced a similar exemption in the 1990s. Under Premier Bob Rae, rent control exemptions for new rental builds were implemented for the same reason: to encourage the construction of new purpose-built rental units. Even the Leader of the Opposition, who served as a staffer during that government, has publicly expressed pride in their achievements, saying, "I'm really proud of what we achieved in government." If the exemptions were necessary then, why would we undermine them now, when we need more housing even more today as well? What we're doing now is building upon the lessons we have learned, creating a regulatory environment that encourages investment while safeguarding tenant rights.

The opposition's Bill 48 risks undoing this progress by eliminating the rent control exemption for new units. This measure, while appearing to offer immediate relief, will have long-term consequences: discouraging developers from building new rental units and exacerbating the very affordability crisis it aims to solve. In contrast, our government's approach ensures the supply of rental housing continues to grow, offering Ontarians more choices and competitive prices.

The lessons of history are clear: Heavy-handed, onesize-fits-all rent control policies stifle innovation and investment.

It's essential to create policies that not only protect existing tenants but also pave the way for future housing needs. This balance is at the heart of our approach. We must learn from past successes and failures, to forge a pathway that benefits all Ontarians. The only sustainable path to rental affordability is increasing the supply of housing.

That's why our government is cutting red tape, streamlining approval processes and reducing costs for developers. It's why we have reduced or eliminated development charges for affordable and non-profit rental units and introduced discounts for family-friendly units. These measures have already shown tangible results, with projects that were once stalled now moving forward. In addition, we're exploring innovative solutions such as modular housing and adaptive reuse of existing buildings to increase the supply of housing. These approaches, combined with our ongoing efforts, demonstrate a comprehensive strategy that prioritizes the needs of all Ontarians. We're not just building homes; we are building hope and opportunity.

Eliminating the rent control exemption for post-2018 units under Bill 48 would send a chilling signal to investors and home builders. Developers already face rising interest rate costs, because of the carbon tax and construction costs and market uncertainties, and this may shift their focus away from Ontario, reducing the pipeline of new rental units. But this approach is hardly surprising from our NDP friends, who often don't seem to have a great grasp of basic economic principles like supply and demand. Their proposal will not only hurt future tenants but also those who are currently seeking affordable housing options.

By maintaining the government's existing balanced policies, we are sending a clear message: Ontario is open for investment and committed to housing solutions that work. The opposition's proposal threatens to undermine this stability, create uncertainty for both developers and tenants. We cannot afford to take such a gamble with the future of housing in our great province.

Our government's approach is clear: We are tackling Ontario's housing crisis by building more homes and protecting tenants. From strengthening protections against evictions to doubling the fines for bad actors, our policies reflect a commitment to fairness and accountability.

Speaker, if you don't believe me—and the member from Waterloo may not believe me, so she can listen to the member from Ottawa West–Nepean, who has said, "We do actually have fairly strong legislation in terms of the compensation and rights of tenants." I agree.

The fact remains that Ontario is a place where newcomers want to make their homes and where businesses and families continue to thrive. Our policies are ensuring that cranes remain in the sky and that homes are built to meet the growing demand.

The opposition's proposal, while superficially appealing, threatens to derail this progress and worsen the affordability crisis in the long term.

Instead of turning back the clock to failed policies, let us move forward. We must continue supporting a balanced approach: protecting the vast majority of tenants under rent control, while creating the conditions for more rental housing construction. Our government remains committed to building a stronger Ontario where everyone has access to a safe and affordable place to call home.

For these reasons, we will be opposing Bill 48 and, instead, supporting the government's balanced rent control policies that are already delivering results for Ontarians. The members opposite talked about legacy. This is one number that I am proud of, Speaker: 513,000 housing starts since 2018—

Interjections.

The Deputy Speaker (Ms. Donna Skelly): Order. The opposition side will come to order.

Mr. Matthew Rae: —despite the federal government raising interest rates, despite the federal government raising the carbon tax, despite rising construction costs because of the market we are in. We will continue to build Ontario. We will continue to build rental housing, and we will continue to build across Ontario—not just in downtown Toronto; in rural Ontario and northern Ontario. Together, we can ensure Ontario remains and has a bright future.

The Deputy Speaker (Ms. Donna Skelly): Further debate? Further debate?

The member for Parkdale–High Park has two minutes to respond.

**Ms. Bhutila Karpoche:** I wanted to first thank my colleagues for their remarks today.

To the Conservative member, the member from Perth-Wellington, Speaker, I would ask him to get new talking points. Whatever he has said today is not based on evidence, is not based on reality on the ground. It's so out of touch. To make things worse, the member is insulting tenants by telling them that they are doing everything in their power to protect tenants. There's a word for it; it's called gaslighting. That's what you're doing.

I'm sure you have heard from tenants in your own ridings-

The Deputy Speaker (Ms. Donna Skelly): I'll ask the member to withdraw.

Ms. Bhutila Karpoche: I withdraw.

But I know that even Conservative members have heard from their constituents who say they feel sick to their stomach every time they know that a renewal for their lease is up, who spend their nights worrying about how much the next increase will be and whether they will be able to scrape together enough to cover the rent. And they have to make unreasonable sacrifices.

Speaker, I'm going to spend the remainder of my time actually recognizing tenants who are doing the good work in our communities, people like the High Park Tenants' Association, Oakwood Vaughan Community Organization, Mimico Estates Tenants' Association, Garden Court Tenants' Association, Royal York Tenants' Association, Junction Residents Association, Livmore High Park Tenants' Association—I'm just so mad, I'm shaking— York South-Weston Tenant Union, Fair Rent Ontario and Ontario Tenants for Fair Rental Housing. These are all groups who represent hundreds of thousands of tenants across this province, who want to see rent control in place, and many of whom live in Conservative ridings, are represented by members who refuse to do anything to protect tenants from—

The Deputy Speaker (Ms. Donna Skelly): The time provided for private members' public business has expired.

Ms. Karpoche has moved second reading of Bill 48, An Act to amend the Residential Tenancies Act, 2006 with respect to rules relating to rent.

Is it the pleasure of the House that the motion carry? I heard a no.

All those in favour of the motion will please say "aye." All those opposed to the motion will please say "nay." In my opinion, the nays have it.

A recorded vote being required, it will be deferred until the next instance of deferred votes.

Second reading vote deferred.

The Deputy Speaker (Ms. Donna Skelly): All matters relating to private members' public business having been completed, this House stands adjourned until tomorrow, December 12, 2024, at 9 a.m.

The House adjourned at 1824.

# LEGISLATIVE ASSEMBLY OF ONTARIO ASSEMBLÉE LÉGISLATIVE DE L'ONTARIO

Lieutenant Governor / Lieutenante-gouverneure: Hon. / L'hon. Edith Dumont, OOnt Speaker / Président de l'Assemblée législative: Hon. / L'hon. Ted Arnott Clerk / Greffier: Trevor Day Deputy Clerk / Sous-Greffière: Valerie Quioc Lim Clerks-at-the-Table / Greffiers parlementaires: Julia Douglas, Meghan Stenson, Christopher Tyrell, Wai Lam (William) Wong Sergeant-at-Arms / Sergent d'armes: Tim McGough

Member and Party /	Constituency /	Other responsibilities /
Député(e) et parti	Circonscription	Autres responsabilités
Allsopp, Tyler (PC)	Bay of Quinte / Baie de Quinte	
Anand, Deepak (PC)	Mississauga—Malton	
Andrew, Jill (NDP)	Toronto—St. Paul's	
Armstrong, Teresa J. (NDP)	London—Fanshawe	
Arnott, Hon. / L'hon. Ted (PC)	Wellington—Halton Hills	Speaker / Président de l'Assemblée législative
Babikian, Aris (PC)	Scarborough—Agincourt	
Bailey, Robert (PC)	Sarnia—Lambton	
Barnes, Patrice (PC)	Ajax	Second Deputy Chair of the Committee of the Whole House / Deuxième Vice-Présidente du Comité plénier de l'Assemblée législative
Begum, Doly (NDP)	Scarborough Southwest / Scarborough-Sud-Ouest	Deputy Leader, Official Opposition / Chef adjointe de l'opposition officielle
Bell, Jessica (NDP)	University—Rosedale	
Bethlenfalvy, Hon. / L'hon. Peter (PC)	Pickering—Uxbridge	Minister of Finance / Ministre des Finances
Blais, Stephen (LIB)	Orléans	
Bouma, Will (PC)	Brantford—Brant	
Bourgouin, Guy (NDP)	Mushkegowuk—James Bay / Mushkegowuk—Baie James	
Bowman, Stephanie (LIB)	Don Valley West / Don Valley-Ouest	
Brady, Bobbi Ann (IND)	Haldimand—Norfolk	
Bresee, Ric (PC)	Hastings-Lennox and Addington	
Burch, Jeff (NDP)	Niagara Centre / Niagara-Centre	
Byers, Rick (PC)	Bruce—Grey—Owen Sound	
Calandra, Hon. / L'hon. Paul (PC)	Markham—Stouffville	Minister of Municipal Affairs and Housing / Ministre des Affaires municipales et du Logement
Cho, Hon. / L'hon. Raymond Sung Joon (PC)	Scarborough North / Scarborough- Nord	Minister for Seniors and Accessibility / Ministre des Services aux aînés et de l'Accessibilité
Cho, Hon. / L'hon. Stan (PC)	Willowdale	Minister of Tourism, Culture and Gaming / Ministre du Tourisme, de la Culture et des Jeux
Clancy, Aislinn (GRN)	Kitchener Centre / Kitchener-Centre	
Clark, Steve (PC)	Leeds—Grenville—Thousand Islands and Rideau Lakes / Leeds— Grenville—Thousand Islands et Rideau Lakes	Government House Leader / Leader parlementaire du gouvernement
Coe, Lorne (PC)	Whitby	
Collard, Lucille (LIB)	Ottawa—Vanier	Third Deputy Chair of the Committee of the Whole House / Troisième Vice-Présidente du Comité plénier de l'Assemblée législative
Crawford, Hon. / L'hon. Stephen (PC)	Oakville	Associate Minister of Mines / Ministre associé des Mines
Cuzzetto, Rudy (PC)	Mississauga—Lakeshore	
Dixon, Jess (PC)	Kitchener South—Hespeler / Kitchener-Sud—Hespeler	
Dowie, Andrew (PC)	Windsor—Tecumseh	
Downey, Hon. / L'hon. Doug (PC)	Barrie-Springwater-Oro-Medonte	Attorney General / Procureur général
Dunlop, Hon. / L'hon. Jill (PC)	Simcoe North / Simcoe-Nord	Minister of Education / Ministre de l'Éducation
Fedeli, Hon. / L'hon. Victor (PC)	Nipissing	Chair of Cabinet / Président du Conseil des ministres Minister of Economic Development, Job Creation and Trade / Ministre du Développement économique, de la Création d'emplois e du Commerce
Fife, Catherine (NDP)	Waterloo	
The, Californie (1991)	( aterioo	

Member and Party / Député(e) et parti	Constituency / Circonscription	Other responsibilities / Autres responsabilités
Flack, Hon. / L'hon. Rob (PC)	Elgin—Middlesex—London	Minister of Agriculture, Food and Agribusiness / Ministre de l'Agriculture, de l'Alimentation et de l'Agroentreprise
Ford, Hon. / L'hon. Doug (PC)	Etobicoke North / Etobicoke-Nord	Leader, Progressive Conservative Party of Ontario / Chef du Parti progressiste-conservateur de l'Ontario Premier / Premier ministre
		Minister of Intergovernmental Affairs / Ministre des Affaires intergouvernementales
Ford, Hon. / L'hon. Michael D. (PC)	York South—Weston / York-Sud— Weston	Minister of Citizenship and Multiculturalism / Ministre des Affaires civiques et du Multiculturalisme
Fraser, John (LIB) French, Jennifer K. (NDP)	Ottawa South / Ottawa-Sud Oshawa	
Gallagher Murphy, Dawn (PC)	Newmarket—Aurora	
Gates, Wayne (NDP)	Niagara Falls	
Gélinas, France (NDP) Ghamari, Goldie (IND)	Nickel Belt Carleton	
Glover, Chris (NDP)	Spadina—Fort York	
Gretzky, Lisa (NDP)	Windsor West / Windsor-Ouest	
Grewal, Hardeep Singh (PC)	Brampton East / Brampton-Est	
Hamid, Zee (PC)	Milton	
Hardeman, Ernie (PC) Harden, Joel (NDP)	Oxford Ottawa Centre / Ottawa-Centre	
Harris, Hon. / L'hon. Mike (PC)	Kitchener—Conestoga	Minister of Red Tape Reduction / Ministre de la Réduction des formalités administratives
Hazell, Andrea (LIB)	Scarborough—Guildwood	
Hogarth, Christine (PC)	Etobicoke—Lakeshore	
Holland, Hon. / L'hon. Kevin (PC)	Thunder Bay—Atikokan	Associate Minister of Forestry and Forest Products / Ministre associates Forêts et des Produits forestiers
Hsu, Ted (LIB)	Kingston and the Islands / Kingston et les Îles	
Jama, Sarah (IND)	Hamilton Centre / Hamilton-Centre	
Jones, Hon. / L'hon. Sylvia (PC)	Dufferin—Caledon	Minister of Health / Ministre de la Santé Deputy Premier / Vice-première ministre
Jones, Hon. / L'hon. Trevor (PC)	Chatham-Kent—Leamington	Associate Minister of Emergency Preparedness and Response / Ministre associé de la Protection civile et de l'Intervention en cas d'urgence
Jordan, John (PC)	Lanark—Frontenac—Kingston	
Kanapathi, Logan (PC)	Markham—Thornhill	
Karpoche, Bhutila (NDP)	Parkdale—High Park	First Deputy Chair of the Committee of the Whole House / Première Vice-Présidente du Comité plénier de l'Assemblée législative
Ke, Vincent (IND)	Don Valley North / Don Valley-Nord	
Kernaghan, Terence (NDP)	London North Centre / London- Centre-Nord	Deputy Opposition House Leader / Leader parlementaire adjoint de l'opposition officielle
Kerzner, Hon. / L'hon. Michael S. (PC)	York Centre / York-Centre	Solicitor General / Solliciteur général
Khanjin, Hon. / L'hon. Andrea (PC)	Barrie—Innisfil	Minister of the Environment, Conservation and Parks / Ministre de l'Environnement, de la Protection de la nature et des Parcs
Kusendova-Bashta, Hon. / L'hon. Natalia (PC)	Mississauga Centre / Mississauga- Centre	Minister of Long-Term Care / Ministre des Soins de longue durée
Leardi, Anthony (PC)	Essex	Deputy Government House Leader / Leader parlementaire adjoint du gouvernement
Lecce, Hon. / L'hon. Stephen (PC)	King—Vaughan	Minister of Energy and Electrification / Ministre de l'Énergie et de l'Électrification
Lumsden, Hon. / L'hon. Neil (PC)	Hamilton East—Stoney Creek / Hamilton-Est—Stoney Creek	Minister of Sport / Ministre du Sport
MacLeod, Lisa (PC)	Nepean	
Mamakwa, Sol (NDP)	Kiiwetinoong	Deputy Leader, Official Opposition / Chef adjoint de l'opposition officielle
Mantha, Michael (IND)	Algoma—Manitoulin	
Martin, Robin (PC)	Eglinton—Lawrence	
McCarthy, Hon. / L'hon. Todd J. (PC)	Durham	Minister of Public and Business Service Delivery and Procurement / Ministre des Services au public et aux entreprises et de l'Approvisionnement
McCrimmon, Karen (LIB)	Kanata—Carleton	

Member and Party / Député(e) et parti	Constituency / Circonscription	Other responsibilities / Autres responsabilités
McGregor, Hon. / L'hon. Graham (PC)	Brampton North / Brampton-Nord	Associate Minister of Auto Theft and Bail Reform / Ministre associé de la Lutte contre le vol d'automobiles et de la Réforme relative aux mises en liberté sous caution
McMahon, Mary-Margaret (LIB)	Beaches—East York	
Mulroney, Hon. / L'hon. Caroline (PC)	York—Simcoe	President of the Treasury Board / Présidente du Conseil du Trésor Minister of Francophone Affaires / Ministre des Affaires francophones
Oosterhoff, Hon. / L'hon. Sam (PC)	Niagara West / Niagara-Ouest	Associate Minister of Energy-Intensive Industries / Ministre associé des Industries à forte consommation d'énergie
Pang, Billy (PC)	Markham—Unionville	
Parsa, Hon. / L'hon. Michael (PC)		Minister of Children, Community and Social Services / Ministre des Services à l'enfance et des Services sociaux et communautaires
Pasma, Chandra (NDP)	Ottawa West—Nepean / Ottawa- Ouest—Nepean	
Piccini, Hon. / L'hon. David (PC)	Northumberland—Peterborough South Northumberland—Peterborough-Sud	/Minister of Labour, Immigration, Training and Skills Development / Ministre du Travail, de l'Immigration, de la Formation et du Développement des compétences
Pierre, Natalie (PC)	Burlington	Deputy Government Whip / Whip adjointe du gouvernement
Pinsonneault, Steve (PC)	Lambton—Kent—Middlesex	
Pirie, Hon. / L'hon. George (PC)	Timmins	Minister of Mines / Ministre des Mines
Quinn, Hon. / L'hon. Nolan (PC)	Stormont—Dundas—South Glengarry	<sup>7</sup> Minister of Colleges and Universities / Ministre des Collèges et Universités
Rae, Matthew (PC)	Perth—Wellington	
Rakocevic, Tom (NDP)	Humber River—Black Creek	
Rasheed, Kaleed (IND)	Mississauga East—Cooksville / Mississauga-Est—Cooksville	
Rickford, Hon. / L'hon. Greg (PC)	Kenora—Rainy River	Minister of Indigenous Affairs and First Nations Economic Reconciliation / Ministre des Affaires autochtones et de la Réconciliation économique avec les Premières Nations Minister of Northern Development / Ministre du Développement du Nord
Riddell, Brian (PC)	Cambridge	
Romano, Ross (PC)	Sault Ste. Marie	
Sabawy, Sheref (PC)	Mississauga—Erin Mills	
Sandhu, Amarjot (PC)	Brampton West / Brampton-Ouest	
Sarkaria, Hon. / L'hon. Prabmeet Singh (PC)	Brampton South / Brampton-Sud	Minister of Transportation / Ministre des Transports
Sarrazin, Stéphane (PC)	Glengarry—Prescott—Russell	
Sattler, Peggy (NDP)	London West / London-Ouest	
Saunderson, Brian (PC)	Simcoe—Grey	
Schreiner, Mike (GRN)	Guelph	
Scott, Laurie (PC)	Haliburton—Kawartha Lakes—Brock	
Shamji, Adil (LIB)	Don Valley East / Don Valley-Est	
Shaw, Sandy (NDP)	Hamilton West—Ancaster—Dundas / Hamilton-Ouest—Ancaster—Dundas	
Skelly, Donna (PC)	Flamborough—Glanbrook	Deputy Speaker / Vice-Présidente Chair of the Committee of the Whole House / Présidente du Comité plénier de l'Assemblée législative
Smith, Dave (PC)	Peterborough—Kawartha	-
Smith, David (PC)	Scarborough Centre / Scarborough- Centre	
Smith, Hon. / L'hon. Graydon (PC)	Parry Sound—Muskoka	Minister of Natural Resources / Ministre des Richesses naturelles
Smith, Laura (PC)	Thornhill	
Stevens, Jennifer (Jennie) (NDP)	St. Catharines	
Stiles, Marit (NDP)	Davenport	Leader, Official Opposition / Chef de l'opposition officielle Leader, New Democratic Party of Ontario / Chef du Nouveau Parti démocratique de l'Ontario
Surma, Hon. / L'hon. Kinga (PC)	Etobicoke Centre / Etobicoke-Centre	Minister of Infrastructure / Ministre de l'Infrastructure
Tabuns, Peter (NDP)	Toronto—Danforth	
Tangri, Hon. / L'hon. Nina (PC)	Mississauga—Streetsville	Associate Minister of Small Business / Ministre associée des Petites Entreprises
Taylor, Monique (NDP)	Hamilton Mountain / Hamilton- Mountain	
Thanigasalam, Hon. / L'hon. Vijay (PC)	Scarborough—Rouge Park	Associate Minister of Housing / Ministre associé du Logement

Member and Party / Député(e) et parti	Constituency / Circonscription	Other responsibilities / Autres responsabilités
Thompson, Hon. / L'hon. Lisa M. (PC)	Huron—Bruce	Minister of Rural Affairs / Ministre des Affaires rurales
Tibollo, Hon. / L'hon. Michael A. (PC)	Vaughan—Woodbridge	Associate Minister of Mental Health and Addictions / Ministre associé délégué à la Santé mentale et à la Lutte contre les dépendances
Triantafilopoulos, Effie J. (PC)	Oakville North—Burlington / Oakville-Nord—Burlington	
Vanthof, John (NDP)	Timiskaming—Cochrane	Opposition House Leader / Leader parlementaire de l'opposition officielle
Vaugeois, Lise (NDP)	Thunder Bay—Superior North / Thunder Bay—Supérieur-Nord	
Wai, Daisy (PC)	Richmond Hill	
West, Jamie (NDP)	Sudbury	
Williams, Hon. / L'hon. Charmaine A. (PC)	Brampton Centre / Brampton-Centre	Associate Minister of Women's Social and Economic Opportunity / Ministre associée des Perspectives sociales et économiques pour les femmes
Wong-Tam, Kristyn (NDP) Yakabuski, John (PC)	Toronto Centre / Toronto-Centre Renfrew—Nipissing—Pembroke	